ECAC DATA DEVELOPMENT WORK GROUP
EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION DATA ELEMENTS ANALYSIS

Introduction

The Data Development Work Group of the New York State Early Childhood Advisory Council (ECAC) is charged with developing a state-wide, cross-program early childhood education longitudinal data system as a first phase toward the development of a broader early childhood services data system. We hope to connect this system to the New York State Education Department's data system to get a much larger view of what types of early childhood education help which children succeed. On February 3, 2011, the Data Development Work Group approved a list of policy and program questions (attached) that they would like answered by the data system. Based on these policy and program questions, a sub group developed a list of the core data elements (attached) we would need to collect from other New York State/New York City data systems to answer these questions.

The data elements were broken up into three sections:
- Workforce-Those staff that are providing early childhood education
- Provider-The individuals and Centers which provide early childhood education
- Child and Family-Those that receive early childhood education

Meetings were held between some members of the sub group with representatives of the following data systems:
- Child Care Facilities System (CCFS)—Office of Children and Family Services
- Child Care Time and Attendance (CCTA)— Office of Children and Family Services
- Child Care Activity Tracking System (CCATS)—New York City Department of Health
- WELS/QualityStarsNY—New York City Early Childhood Professional Development Institute
- Workforce Registry—New York State Early Childhood Professional Development Institute
- NACCRRAware—Early Care and Learning Council
- Automated Child Care Information System (ACCIS) —New York City Administration for Children's Services
- New York City Head Start—New York City Administration for Children's Services
- Early Intervention (EI)—New York State Department of Health
- Universal Pre-Kindergarten (UPK)—New York State Education Department
- Preschool Special Education (PSE)—New York State Education Department

These meetings were used to determine which identified data elements each data system captured. Also reviewed was information from the Federal Head Start Program Information Report and data export.

It is important to note that some of the UPK data and PSE data are not centralized at New York State Education Department and may be held at the local school district in various electronic and/or paper formats. Due to lack of centralized data, we did not investigate this further and the information we have on data elements are based on centralized data only.

This analysis is just to determine what data elements are available in New York State and New York City early childhood education data systems. It does not, nor is it meant to; delve into the confidentiality and/or privacy questions, or permissions to use the data that may arise. They will need to be determined as we move forward with this project.

Provider Data Elements

Provider data elements are the most comprehensive of the three sections.

Child Care - With the data from the New York State and New York City systems, we will have data on all of the legally exempt providers that serve children who receive subsidized child care, as well as regulated and licensed child care programs:
- Day Care Centers - provide care for more than six children at a time, not in a personal residence.
- Small Day Care Centers - provide care for up to six children, not in a personal residence.
- Family Day Care Homes - provide care for three to six children at a time in a residence; may add one or two school-age children. The maximum allowable number of children will depend on whether there are and how many infants are in care.
- Group Family Day Care Homes - provide care for seven to twelve children at a time in a residence; may add one or two school-age children. The maximum allowable number of children will depend on whether there are and how many infants are in care. A provider must use an assistant when more than six children are present.

  Each of the programs listed above can serve children ages six weeks through twelve years and operate for more than three hours a day, except for New York City, which licenses all Day Care Centers, regardless of how many hours in a day they operate.

- School-Age Child Care Programs - provide care for more than six children from kindergarten through age twelve. Care for children during non-school hours; also may provide care during school vacation periods and holidays.

- For purposes of this discussion, Legally Exempt providers refer to those who are not required to be licensed, serve fewer than three children and are receiving child care subsidies.

NACCRRAware- collects information from providers on a voluntary basis, i.e.; providers' contact the local Child Care Resource & Referral programs to get on their list for referrals and trainings. It may have informal providers who do not receive subsidies and are not listed in other systems.

Early Intervention (EI)- collects information on the provider of EI services, including the agencies they may be affiliated with.

Preschool Special Education (PSE)- only collects information on the agencies/facilities, not individual providers who may be contracted to provide special education services.

Universal Pre-Kindergarten (UPK)- only has centralized information on UPK providers when the UPK classrooms are located in a school districts school. If the local school district contracts out with another provider, New York State Education Department will not have that information.

Head Start- programs are licensed by the applicable New York City or New York State systems and their information will be stored in CCFS or CCATS.

There may be some duplication of providers between the various New York State/New York City systems, and there may also be duplication of providers within NACCRRAware, as the NACCRRAware system does not allow a local Child Care Resource & Referral program to access a different Child Care Resource & Referral program's data. EI and PSE also have information on certain centers which provide these services that are licensed by CCFS & CCATS. This information is flagged in the EI system.

Unique identifiers-CCATS, CCFS, EI, PSE, UPK and NACCRRAware each has its own unique identifier, though CCATS does get information on certain providers from CCFS and keeps the CCFS identifier in its system for those providers. The Workforce Registry and QualtyStarsNY will be using information and storing the unique identifiers from CCATS and CCFS. It is unclear at this point how the two Administration for Children's Services systems (ACCIS and New York City Head Start) interact with the other systems in New York City and New York State. The EI and PSE systems also do the billing, so it has the Tax ID/social security number of the provider. The Registry will be able to collect what fringe benefits each provider provides for employees.

Contact information-We will be able to gather the name, address/location, program type(s) and contact information for the providers, as well as the owner/operators of those facilities, though many of them will be one and the same. There is also geocoding information available in CCATS and CCFS for mapping purposes. Information on complaints, investigations, inspections and enforcement are also available. EI and PSE only have information on complaints if the complaint is specifically made to EI or PSE. EI does not track enforcement or

do inspections. PSE does inspections (Quality Improvement and monitoring), but does not collect enforcement information. CCATS collects information on the hours and days open, while CCFS does that only for Legally Exempt providers.

Classroom information-For classroom information, the data elements we are looking for are not as robust.   There is data to determine how many classrooms there are and the capacity of each classroom, as well as the overall number of staff at each program. CCFS has the age range of the classroom.   It is possible that QualityStarsNY will be gathering classroom specific quality information.   There is no current information on the curriculum used in each classroom. The Workforce Registry will have the ability to track which teachers and aides are assigned to each classroom, and possibly which curriculum is used and what rate is charged in each classroom, but that information will need to be completed by the facility director or other responsible staff member on a regular basis.

Rate Information-Rate information about providers and age ranges will typically be from the market rate survey only, though CCTA may have the rate the provider charges to the public. Funding sources and funding source amount will be difficult to determine, outside of PSE, Head Start and providers having children who receive child care subsidies. CCATS does track what type of site it is, Head Start and/or Administration for Children's Services Contract site and whether the program receives Child and Adult Care Food program subsidies, accepts Administration for Children's Services vouchers, and has an Early Intervention program (there is some funding associated with Early Intervention) and Department of Education Universal Pre-K. CCTA does have information on the specific breakdown of different stream of subsidy monies that are used. PSE is the only system that does have information on the overall operating costs of the providers.

Medication certification-CCATS, CCFS and NACCRRAware have information on whether a provider is certified to dispense medication. CCFS collects medication certification information on the individual staff member. None of the systems, except for EI collect information on any screenings and/or assessments that are used by the provider.

Workforce Data Elements

Workforce information- Outside of the EI and PSE workforce, it is expected that almost all of the workforce data elements that we are looking for will be collected by the Workforce Registry, though some of the specifics are still being determined at this time, such as what are the required fields and which information entered into the Workforce Registry will be required or voluntary. Certain information may need to be entered or approved by the Director/Supervisor, such as classroom information, position and pay. Though the Workforce Registry is initially focusing on licensed/regulated providers, it is the long-term goal of the Workforce Registry to collect this information on Legally Exempt providers as well.

Unique identifier-CCFS will have the best unique identifier, as they will use the fingerprint characteristics, which are unique, to determine if the person is already in their system (all staff get fingerprinted by the OCFS Criminal History Review Unit upon hire). CCATS does have duplicates in their system. The Workforce Registry will be self-enrolled, though there will be checks in the system to greatly reduce the possibility of duplicate entries for the same person. The last 5 digits of the social security number will be collected by the Workforce Registry. CCFS is allowed to track SSN only for those who have (or had) financial responsibility for the facility. EI has a unique identifier for their workforce and they will also have either the individuals' professional license number, or if they are a teacher, the social security number.

Contact and demographic information-CCFS and CCATS collect very basic information on Workforce. CCATS only collects the name of the individual, though they do have the ability to store address and basic training information. CCFS has more information on staff, such as DOB, language fluency and gender. The Criminal History Review Unit will have the staff address is only at time of fingerprinting. CCFS also has information on the start/stop dates of staff at each facility, which is only updated when the staff start at a new facility, CCFS is informed by the facility or regulator the staff is no longer working there, or at time of license renewal. Administration for Children's Services Head Start just has information on staff in Administration for Children's Services funded Head Start programs. EI will have information on address and language fluency. EI will also have the best tracking system in terms of start/end date, hourly wage and hours billed.

Education, training and credential information- in CCFS it is tracked solely for the director, on-site provider, alternate provider, assistant and alternate assistant positions. EI will have information on some education attainment and will have information on all of their licenses/credentials. The Workforce Registry will be collecting information on credentials, higher education achievement, including information on the amount of credits the individual has in specific areas, and trainings taken. The Workforce Registry will also have the same information on some trainers who are part of the system.

Child & Family Data Elements

Child and family information-There is available information on children and families involved in early childhood education programs for those who are receiving subsidized child care services, EI, PSE and UPK. All of the subsidized child care information will come from the CCTA and ACCIS systems. CCFS will have this information only for those at Legally Exempt homes. CCFS will be getting the information from CCTA and this will not be implemented until at least 2012. EI will have data on all children who are referred to EI services, any assessment and testing information the child received, as well as information on services the child is receiving. PSE and UPK will have information on children receiving those services through the school district.

CCTA will be getting its child and family information from OTDA's Welfare Management System (WMS), which is the State's system for capturing basic demographic and eligibility data for Temporary Assistance, Medicaid, Food Stamps, and services, such as child care subsidy. WMS is the system of record for non-New York City children who receive subsidized child care. ACCIS does have a nightly feed with WMS (down state) to verify that children are on cash assistance for the TANF population, but ACCIS is the system of record for New York City children who receive subsidized child care.

Unique identifier-CCTA will have the child and family unique identifier from WMS. CCTA/WMS does collect social security number information on the child, but it is not required, even though a recent analysis by OCFS staff shows that 95% of those children receiving subsidized child care services do have a social security number in the system. EI has a child and family unique identifier as well as the child social security number.

Contact and demographic information-Much of the CCTA demographic data will come directly from WMS, or if not in CCTA, is recorded in WMS. EI, ACCIS and CCTA/WMS have information on the address, family income (EI will only have insurance information, which may be used as a proxy for income), benefits receiving, language spoken at home, number of siblings in home and receiving subsidized child care. It is unclear if PSE and UPK will have consistent information on address, but it will have county, school district and language spoken at home. There is also information on the child date of birth, gender, race and ethnicity. EI, PSE and ACCIS will also have child language information.

Attendance and testing information- CCTA, EI, PSE and ACCIS capture information on the hours and days (1/2 day or full day only for PSE) each child attends which provider and how much the subsidy/rate amount is. EI will have information on all assessments/test results. ACCIS and EI will have information any special services children are receiving.

Conclusions

Program information-With the data from the New York State and New York City child care systems, we will be able to determine all of the legally exempt providers that serve children who receive subsidized child care, as well as regulated and licensed child care programs, as a starting point for the system. There should also be good data on address and complaint/inspection/enforcement history. EI and PSE will be able to give us good information on those agencies that provide these services. There will be a lack of information on those CBO's that provide UPK, unless they are in one of the child care systems and it is known they provide UPK. We will be able to gather QualityStarsNY information on all of the participating providers.

Workforce information-For workforce, while currently the various data systems do collect information on almost all members of the early childhood education workforce, it is basic

information and may not be enough to help us answer our policy and program questions. If the Workforce Registry is successfully implemented statewide on a voluntary basis, there should be enough demographic and educational/training information to answer the policy and program questions. Making the use of the Workforce Registry mandatory for most or all early childhood education staff in New York State, it will give us a much more concrete picture of the early childhood education workforce.

Child and family information-We will get a complete picture of those children and families receiving EI and/or subsidized child care services only. There will be some child information on those receiving PSE and UPK services. We have no information on children and families in the early childhood education system who do not receive these services or are in a Head Start program, nor is there any system currently in place or envisioned that will capture this information. This poses a major problem in answering a number of the policy and program questions for children receiving early childhood education, as we will only have information on a cohort of those receiving some type of state supported service. Due to lack of accurate utilization data in licensed and regulated early childhood education programs, it is difficult to put a percentage on that cohort.

Classroom information-At this point, we are unable to get specific early childhood education classroom information needed to match the staff to the provider to the student, which would be very useful in answering a number of the policy and program questions. The Workforce Registry will have the ability to track which teachers and aides are assigned to each classroom, and possibly which curriculum is used and what rate is charged in each classroom, but that information will need to be completed by the facility director or other responsible staff member. There is no system in place to track which student is in which classroom.

Assessment/screening information-Early Intervention is the only program that collects information on which Assessment/ Screenings are used by providers as well as the child results of those Assessment/ Screenings**.**